



SAN FRANCISCO
**GRAFFITI
 ADVISORY
 BOARD**

City Hall
 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, #248
 San Francisco, CA 94102-4645
 415.695.2003
 www.sfdpw.org/gab

Edwin M. Lee, Mayor

Larry Stringer, Chair
Jana Lord, Vice Chair

Graffiti Advisory Board

Minutes for March 13, 2014
 30 Van Ness Avenue, 5th Floor
 San Francisco, California

1. Call to Order: 3:35 p.m., the meeting was called to order.

PRESENT

- DPW – Larry Stringer
- SFPD – Martin Ferreira
- SFDA – Karen Catalona
- MAYOR – Alex Popovics
- RecPark – Eric Pawlowsky
- SFUSD – Robert Sakurai
- Seat 1 – Sam McCormick
- Seat 2 – Leonid Nakhodkin
- Seat 3 – Stephanie Greenburg
- Seat 5 – Melorra Green
- Seat 9 – Laura Putnam
- Seat 10 – Jann Fitzgerald
- Seat 11 – Eric Mersch
- Seat 15 – Daniel Kling (bus)
- Seat 16 – Rebecca Delgado Rottman (art)
- Seat 17 –Jana Lord (mta/shelter)

ABSENT

- Seat 4 – Charles Moody (EXC)
- Seat 6 – Mark Friend (EXC)
- Seat 7 – **Vacant**
- Seat 8 – Doug Hayward (EXC)
- Seat 12– (youth) **Vacant**
- Seat 13 – Jonathan Goldberg (SF beaut)
- Seat 14 – Dee Dee Workman (bus) (EXC)
- SFMTA MUNI – **INACTIVE**
- SFMTA DPT – **INACTIVE**

- **Others present:** Jimmer Cassiol, DPW; Tyra Fennell, SFAC; Conor Johnston, Legislative Aide for Supervisor London Breed; Kearstin Krehbiel, San Francisco Beautiful; Ryan Rickert, Clean Slate Group, Greg Dillon; Cara Chase; Derek Chamberlain; Gary Garcia

2. Welcome and Introductions: Chair Larry Stringer welcomed Board members and other attendees. Each member and guest introduced themselves. Members checked attendance; and, establish there is a quorum at this time. Call to order 3:40 pm.

3. Public Comment:

- Greg Dillon would like to suggest that the board way in on Supervisor Breeds legislation and request that large companies such as AT&T, which has a lot of street furniture around the City, be given less than the current allotment of 30 days to abate graffiti on its street furniture property.
 - Large companies have a big infrastructure and resources (more so than the average homeowner or small business) and the time allotted should be much shorter than 30 days
 - Large companies, such as AT&T, should have the same graffiti quick abatement requirement as DPW
 - Other graffiti abatement ideas should be added to supervisor Breed's legislation
- Conor Johnston, Legislative Aide to Supervisor Breed stated that they will be announcing legislation at a press conference on Tuesday to wish all of you are invited
 - This is a result of three to four months of collaboration with many of you in this room
 - Thank you again for all of you hard work and input and we look forward to seeing you on Tuesday, on the Polk street side of City Hall
- Leonid Nathodkin (seat 2) asked that the members on this board if they would change the monthly GAB meeting from the second Thursday of the month to the first Thursday of the month
 - He stated that he has three commission meetings on the second Thursday of every month
 - He will bring it up again on during new business later in this meeting
- Larry Mathews spoke introduced two of his Erie Street neighbors Cara Chase and Gary Garcia
 - Larry stated that the murals have destroyed their property as well as his
 - He stated that GAB and DPW has denied reputedly having any involvement in the Erie Street murals
 - Larry held up the email that was sent out from DPW requesting input or suggestions for StreetSmARTS mural location (the only mural program sectioned in a joint effort with GAB, DPW, and SFAC)
 - Larry Stringer (Chair – DPW) reiterated the fact again to Mr. Mathews that the only mural program sanctioned by GAB, DPW, and SFAC is the StreetSmARTS program and again reiterated the fact that the murals on Erie Street are NOT part of the StreetSmARTS program
 - Mr. Mathews stated that he appreciates what Supervisor breed is doing. He stated that they had been doing it in San Diego and 75 – 90 percent of the graffiti problem is gone

March 13, 2014 Graffiti Advisory Board Minutes

- Mr. Mathews also stated that they just started doing it in Santa Rosa a couple months ago and they just arrested a guy yesterday, 75 tags, he's going to get a big fine and probably go to jail.
- Gary Garcia introduced himself and stated that he works at Sherwin Williams on South Van Ness at 13th.
 - He stated that they abated graffiti on Erie Street on Tuesday and today, they have new tags
 - They are having issues with people getting up on the roof
 - They have spent a lot of money on safety measures to try and keep people off the roof and to keep them from tagging on their properties at 101 eye level
 - Larry Mathew added that tagging is up 200 percent since there were murals painted in the Alley
- Cara Chase introduced herself and stated that she is representing the property across the street which she has owned for seven years
 - It's a beautiful metal corrugated building which has won design awards
 - It a building that is not supposed to be painted
 - She stated there are some things that she and Mr. Mathews differ on that that she appreciates graffiti art as an art form, she has photographed is all around the world, she stated she understands that it is a form of expression BUT, this is their personal property and what is happening to their building is not artwork
 - She stated that they have spent over \$5,000 in one year installing cameras and lights
 - Vandals are acid etching the windows
 - They feel they are being terrorized
 - Currently they are spending a lot of money abating the graffiti and then to get a notice and fined from the City is like being double-victimized
 - She feels that things have gotten worse since the murals in the alley were commissioned and she is requesting help
- Larry Stinger (Chair – DPW) reiterated that fact again that there are many organizations and individuals in the city who do mural projects
 - Larry stated that the City has a very detailed process involved in the only mural program sanctioned by DPW in a joint venture with the SFAC called StreetSmARTS.
 - There are others such as Precita Eyes who put up murals but have nothing to do with the City agencies
 - It has been proven that the addition to murals in neighborhoods has deterred the amount of graffiti in those particular areas and most of the properties that have a StreetSmARTS mural were tagged constantly and most of those property have not been tagged since the murals when up
 - When this is done properly and murals placed on the right property it has proven to be a deterrent to graffiti vandalism
 - The murals have also become a benefit to the neighborhoods in which they are located and in some cases become a tourist destination sight such a Clarion Alley for example

- Derek Chamberlain stated that he is in charge of the mural project on Erie
 - He has been maintaining it for 2 years
 - He met with the Sheriff's office this week and they thanked him for all the work they do in the alley
 - He stated that he has nothing at all to do with Mr. Mathews' building
 - He stated that he offered to buff Mr. Mathews' building for free and Mr. Mathew's rebuffed the offer
- **Public comment Closed.**

4. Presentation: Ryan Rickert, President and Founder, Clean Slate Group
www.cleanslategroupus.com

- Thanked the Graffiti Advisory Board for allowing him to be here to present his city beautification company
- They focus on using art and photography for city beatification purposes, specializing in graffiti resistant films and coatings
- The company has partnered with 3M
- A portion of their profits are given back to local youth non-profit organizations
- Ryan presented a PowerPoint presentation along video to the board which can be found on their web site at www.cleanslategroupus.com
- The benefits of wraps over painting is the resistant coating allows for simple wipe off of graffiti vandalism as well as the material being gouge resistant
- Driving around the city he stated that he hasn't seen one mailbox that hasn't been tagged with graffiti vandalism
- They worked with 3M to bring their anti-graffiti vinyl to market about eight years ago
- Clean Slate Group has all the staff and equipment needed – they are a one stop shop
- They are currently working on certification in the top 50 green print shops in the U.S.
- The cost is approximately \$10.50 per square foot with a seven year life expectancy and you're looking at \$300 - \$700 for the utility/traffic signal boxes
- 3M also guarantees that this material will NOT cause the inside of the box to heat up
- That concludes the presentation and open to any questions

5. Presentation: Tyra Fennell, SF Arts Commission, StreetSmARTS update

- Tyra introduced herself to the board
- She is disappointed that Mr. Mathews did not stick around for her presentations because she feels she could have answered many of his questions about the one City sanction mural program which is StreetSmARTS
- With the StreetSmARTS program we work with property owners who are frequently vandalized and put them together with vetted artist on placing a mural on their property

- SFAC has a an agreement with the property owner and also with the artist
- The property owner must add the artist onto the insurance as one would when doing work on their property
- The artist agreement includes a waiver of the VARA and CAPA law which gives the property owner all rights over the mural
- We have found that murals are in fact a deterrent to graffiti vandalism
- We have a quota of 20 murals per year
- We have \$2,400 max that we can put towards a mural
- As of this year, we have some additional policies in place to address the concerns of the community. A rendering of the proposed mural must now be approved the Arts Commission
- What I've been doing is working with property owners and leveraging other funds for high impact on a high traffic, highly visible areas
- Tyra proceeded to go through her PowerPoint presentations showing current StreetSmARTS murals and renderings of proposed approved murals
- We are currently having an issue in the Mission where one or two graffiti vandals are destroying murals
- Tyra presented an Instagram of one of the prolific graffiti vandals in the Mission area
- We have recently opened the call for artist and we are vetting new artists for the program
- The Arts Commission is working hand in hand with the Office of Economic and Workforce Development (OEWD) which has a program called "SF SHINES" which is connected with the "invest in neighborhoods" project.
- Invest in neighborhoods
- The goal is to beautify merchant spaces along the corridor
- Before and after photos were shown to the group
- That concludes the presentation and open to any questions

6. Review and approval of the draft February 13, 2014 minutes. Alex Popovics (seat Mayor) made a motion to approve and seconded by Stephanie Greenburg (seat16): Minutes approved.

7. Chair's Report:

- For the period of February 2014 the number of calls for graffiti on public property was 515. This number is down slightly from the same time last year with 624 calls.
- Calls for graffiti on private property for February 2014 reported by the public was 520, plus 652 internal cases for a total of 1,172; down slightly compared to the same time last year, January 2013, with a total of 1,204 reports from internal and external sources.
- Inspections of reports of private graffiti in February 2014, which are taking place within 3 calendar days, was 92%. Slightly down from the DPW goal to maintain the response rate above 95%.

- On average for FY13/14, it continues to take an average of 1.3 days for DPW to inspect reports of private graffiti. Last year at this time, the average was 3.1 days.
- In January 2014 DPW issued 698 new private graffiti NOVs (compared to 1,306 in January 2013), of which 88.5% have been owner abated. Of those 698 January cases, 8 cases have gone blight.
- Of the 698 new NOV cases in January 2014, districts 3 (North Beach, Chinatown, Telegraph Hill), 6 (Tenderloin, SOMA, Civic Center), 9 (Mission, Bernal Heights, Portola) received the most new NOV's with 181 in D9, 152 in D6, and 82 in D3.
- **Newly and officially appointed GAB members:** Eric Pawlowsky (seat RPD) appointed by General Manager, Phil Ginsburg; Karen Catalona (seat SFDA), appointed by the District Attorney; and Dee Dee Workman (seat 14). Dee Dee will start attending the GAB meetings next month.
- **Vacant and inactive GAB seats:** Vacant (2): 7 and 12 (youth). Inactive (2): seats SFMTA-MUNI, and SFMTA- DPT. **We have applications in for seat 7.**
- **Legislation:** District 5 Supervisor, London Breed, is continuing to work with members of this board and staff from various City departments on legislation which targets repeat offenders for restitution. The press conference abounding her plan is scheduled for Tuesday March 18th at 12:00 noon.
- **Community Clean Team Update:** The 2014 calendar for the Giant Sweep Community Clean Team events.
 - The next event is our **Arbor Day and Eco Fair!** We will have 20 vendors at the event. Bring your children and help plant a tree!
 - Taking place this Saturday, March 15th in districts 2 and 5.
 - The kickoff will be at 9:00 am at Ella Hill Hutch Community Center.
 - Posters for this event and the entire 2014 Clean Team events are on the table.
- **Giant Sweep Update:**
 - The dates for the next 3 Giant Sweep events are scheduled for:
 - Friday, April 25th
 - Friday, June 20th
 - Friday, September 29th
 - We continue to go into individual schools and perform Giant Sweep anti-litter assemblies and presentations in a joint venture with the Department of Environment and SFMTA. If you have any contact with any schools, please talk to Jimmer and see if we can set something up for those schools
 - Over 15 entries for our Giant Sweep PSA competition have been received. The winning video will receive a \$1,000 prize.
 - Soon, we will also to be kicking off the Giant Sweep neighborhood volunteer cleanup competition
 - The Giant Sweep program will be raffling off one iPad Mini per month over the next 6 months in addition to signed baseballs, Giants game tickets, and

a grand prize raffle taking place in July 2014. Everyone who has signed the pledge will be eligible to be in the raffle drawings

- **Please go to sfgiantsweep.org and check for updates sign the pledge if you have not done so already! Pass the information along to everyone you know asking them to sign the pledge as well!**
- **Graffiti Workshops:** DPW is hosting a series of anti-graffiti workshops for property owners and business owners.
 - The next workshop will be taking place on Wednesday, March 26 at the Chinatown Library for districts 2 and 3
 - All are welcome to attend
 - Flyers are on the table
- **Graffiti Watch training:**
 - Members of the Top of Broadway CBD took the graffiti watch training on Tuesday, March 11th.
 - We are currently scheduling the next graffiti watch training with the date and location still TBD.
 - If you, or anyone you know, are interested in joining the Graffiti Watch program, please contact Jimmer Cassiol.
- **Sub-committees** are meeting each month prior to the full GAB meeting. If you have not yet signed up for a sub-committee, please talk to Jimmer Cassiol and let him know which sub-committee you'd like to participate in - Abatement, Education, or Law Enforcement.
- **The next meeting is Thursday, April 10, 2014.**
 - **You should have already received the 2014 calendar through email and there are also printed copies on the table.**

8. Old Business:

1. Current bylaws (review and amendments)
 - a. Draft proposal for "at large" members (Jana Lord seat 17)
 - i. This item needs to be review again due to the fact that adding three seats to this body would require and amendment to the Administrative through sponsorship and introduction from a member of the BOS.
 - ii. We will review this item again next month (April)
 - b. Item II B (page 2) – who will chair the meeting if the Chair and Vice-Chair are absent from the same meeting (Rebecca Delgado Rottman seat 16)
 - i. The City Attorney's confirmed that this update to the bylaws adding in language to have the facilitator/recording secretary step in to chair the meeting when the Chair and Co-Chair are

absent can be done, but the draft revision must be published 10 days prior to the vote at this board

- c. Add in: who will chair subcommittee meeting when the chair of the subcommittee is absent –
 - i. The City Attorney's office confirmed that this update to the bylaws to include language for when the subcommittee chair is absent, attending subcommittee members will select an 'acting chair' for that subcommittee meeting can be done, but the draft revision must be published 10 days prior to the vote at this board
- Items 1 a, b, and c will need to be discussed again at the April 10th meeting

9. Sub-committee Reports:

- ABATEMENT:
 - Subcommittee Chair Eric Mersch reported:
 - The abatement subcommittee is requesting that Gretchen Rude (DPW) provide the subcommittee with a complete informational explanation on the NOV process so they can better understand the mechanics
- LAW ENFORCEMENT:
 - Subcommittee Chair Martin Ferreira reported:
 - Monthly arrests: 11 adults and 2 juveniles were arrested in February for graffiti vandalism
 - Referrals to the JAWS/Juvenile Squat member program are up. It appears the efforts of Larry Stringer and Mohammad Nuru are paying off and all juveniles getting arrested are being referred by the courts to the program and we need to make sure this continues
 - The DA's office is fought hard on keeping felony charges of a recent case of a graffiti vandal arrested with 10 – 15 thousand dollars worth of damage but a judge allowed the case to plead down to a misdemeanor. The DA did an outstanding job on this case
 - Two cases of interest have to do with a vandals defacing murals in the City and another is the Hibernia Bank graffiti vandalism
- EDUCATION:
 - Subcommittee Chair Robert Sakurai reported:
 - Still waiting to meet with the School Board regarding introducing the play "Fall of X" into the curriculum but looking into other avenues into the SFUSD system since they are not making any headway with the School Board route
 - There will be an attempt to go through the Board of Supervisors
 - Jana Lord is continuing to work on summarized the key point from the Valarie Spicer presentation given at the 2013 Zero Graffiti International conference and will provide a copy to the other subcommittee members
 - There has been an issue with regards to the budget analyst's attempt (at the request of Supervisor Breed) to create a report to determine how much the city agencies spend each year on graffiti abatement

- Suggestion was made to ask the Mayor to require all city departments to include a line item in its budget for graffiti abatement and be able to document and track such costs
- Good news! The graffiti Advisory Board has a few PSA opportunities with two television stations and one radio broadcasting company. Rebecca Delgado-Rottman (seat 16) and Jana Lord (seat 17) will work together on creating scripts

10. New Business:

- Larry Stringer (seat DPW)
 - Draft letter to the Mayor requesting that all city departments/agencies include a line item in its budget and also require them to track/document graffiti related expenses
- Leonid Nakhodkin (seat 2)
 - Researched the board creating a foundation or fund to collect money for GAB use of various purposes. He provided a document to Jimmer which Jimmer will send in PDF format to the board members before next meeting as well as information regarding the process of raising funds
 - Proposed having a future presenters be vetted and approved through the board prior to actually presenting at the board
 - Proposed moving the monthly meeting to the first Thursday of each month

11. Adjournment: The meeting was closed at 4:55 p.m.

Next Meeting Date: The next Graffiti Advisory Board meeting is scheduled to be held on **Thursday, April 10, 2014** at 30 Van Ness Avenue, 5th Floor, in DPW's Department of Engineering Main Conference Room.

The three subcommittees will meet from 3:00 p.m. – 3:30 p.m. (just prior to the full GAB meeting)