

City Hall 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, #248 San Francisco, CA 94102-4645 415.695.2003 www.sfdpw.org/gab

> Carla Short, Chair Jana Lord, Vice Chair

# **Graffiti Advisory Board** Thursday, January 14, 2021 **Regular Meeting 3:30 p.m.** – 5:00 p.m. WebEx (virtual meeting) San Francisco, California

# MINUTES

- 1. Call to Order 3:35 pm
- 2. Welcome and Introductions Present Members: Michael Santos, Carla Short, Cadi Poile, Officer Martin Ferreira, Julia Gonzales, Jean Barish, Robert Bardell, Cammy Blackstone, Jessica Cabrera, Todd Berman, Earl Shaddix, Devin Jones, Darcy Brown, Amelia Linde, Daniel Kling, Michael Petricca, Margeaux Casillas, and Greg Dillon. Members of the Public: Ramses Alvarez (SF Public Works), Eva Chang (SF Public Works), Gideon Kramer, and Anna Lisa Escobedo. Excused Absences: Johnny Wong.
- 3. Public Comment The public may comment on any matter within the Advisory Board's jurisdiction at this time. Please comment on agenda items below when the item is called. Comments may be limited to two minutes at the discretion of the Chair.
- 4. Approval of draft **November** draft minutes (discussion and action item) –Minutes reviewed and approved.
- 5. Report by Chair This is Carla Short's last meeting as the Chair. The response rate for December public property graffiti abatement inquiries was 100%. Although the total number of Notice of Violations (NOVs) issued in December 2020 (243) is lower than that of December 2019 (294), the total NOVs to blight has increased 41.5%. Johnny Wong is no longer a part of the Graffiti Advisory Board and San Francisco Recreation and Park will assign a new representative. Todd Berman is resigning and District 9 will be represented by Anna Lisa Escobedo starting in February 2021.
- 6. Subcommittee Reports
  - a. Education Jean Barish and Margeaux Casillas discussed the possibility of Clear Channel putting up anti-graffiti public service announcements and ad campaigns on bus stop shelters and billboards. Earl Shaddix has worked with Clear Channel before and thinks it'll be effective if we can get youth to create art for the ad campaigns. Todd Berman offers his connections to the art community for the design and agrees that getting youth involved is good. Earl shares that Clear Channel's community printing rate for posters is \$75 which is fair. The client doesn't get to choose where the ads go; Clear Channel does and takes care of installation and removal. Greg Dillon expresses that we should be cautious about the design and messaging so graffiti taggers won't retaliate.
  - b. Abatement Shared spaces and parklets are getting tagged during the lockdown and Greg Dillon thinks we should be gentle on our enforcement on restaurants. Earl Shaddix said Paint The Void is painting parklets and asked other members to send impacted restaurant and café owners his way.

London Breed, Mayor

- c. Law Enforcement Officer Martin Ferreira reports that 5 arrests were made in November and 8 in December which is slightly more than average for the cold months. A mural celebrating Filipino artists at the Asian Art Museum was tagged and a suspect has been arrested. Officer Ferreira likes the Education Committee's ad campaign idea and says, "Where we've made progress in the past as a city is when we had different agencies showing the same message: there is a difference between art and graffiti [vandalism]." Todd wonders if the muralist was contacted and Officer Ferreira explains that it would be handled by the investigations team at the Tenderloin police station. Usually, the owner of the mural will contact the muralist and get an estimate for the damage. The cost of restoring a mural can be quite pricey. Members of the public in Districts 4 and 8 (Chinatown) have sent a lot of complaints about an uptick in graffiti and blight. Michael Petricca notices that the downtown area has been hit hard too and agrees with Officer Ferreira's observations. Julia Gonzalez updates the Board: The District Attorney's Office is pursuing felony charges for the Asian Art Museum mural and the preliminary hearing will be in early February.
- 7. Old Business (discussion and possible action item)
  - a. The Board did not discuss old action items.
- 8. New Business (discussion and possible action item)
  - a. Todd Berman's resignation
    - i. Todd believes the Graffiti Advisory Board has been effective at trouble-shooting the process of converting 311 reports about vandalism into abatement, holding corporate partners with the city accountable for abatement of vandalism on their property, and making the whole process more friendly and accessible for small business and property owners. However, he feels that the Graffiti Advisory Board has not been in the practice of considering the benefits of graffiti and promoting positive aspects of graffiti art.
    - ii. Todd introduces his replacement Anna Lisa Escobedo, a founder of Calle 24, muralist, and art restorer. Anna introduces herself.
    - iii. Greg Dillon thanks Todd for his service and adds that the Board does focus more on the vandalism and everyone benefits from Todd's perspective as an artist and educator.
  - b. Graffiti Advisory Board Annual Report
    - iv. Greg wants the Board to write an annual report to give to the Board of Supervisors and the Mayor.
  - c. Use of the term "graffiti"
    - v. Cammy Blackstone appreciates Todd's input and talks about Uncle Nate's Creativity Time on a government channel. She thinks there should be a government review on how the word graffiti is used.
  - d. Public Comment
    - vi. As a former member of the Graffiti Advisory Board, Gideon Kramer explains his personal history with the Board and said that he quit because it was ineffective. Gideon thinks there is a tendency to whitewash the vandalism aspect of graffiti in San Francisco and makes a clear distinction between art with permission and vandalism. He hopes to rejoin the Board. Gideon believes that "graffiti is corrosive to society." He observes that we find graffiti on walls in neighborhoods that cannot express themselves and unabated in neighborhoods where people are preoccupied with surviving or getting by. His issue with 311 reported graffiti is that it's reactive, not proactive. Communities that care about graffiti vandalism get the attention and that is not the way it should be. He lobbied for a



City Hall 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, #248 San Francisco, CA 94102-4645 415.695.2003 www.sfdpw.org/gab

> Carla Short, Chair Jana Lord, Vice Chair

different approach and had a paid contract "Green Patrol" with Ed Lee and at the end of the 18 months, Ed Lee did not meet with him or debrief with him. He also wrote the street cleaning manuals for DPW under contract and years later, witnessed DPW staff carrying the manuals but not following its instructions. He hopes there's more public education about the corrosive types of graffiti. Gideon remarks that maybe a tenth of 1% doing graffiti has talent, the rest are scrawling nonsense, and "their tags are no different than urinating on a wall as far as... [he] is concerned."

- vii. Todd Berman adds that people spent hours to express themselves in their art in the Mission.
- viii. Officer Ferreira thinks members of the Board should do research on their own, read articles, and watch YouTube videos on graffiti and graffiti taggers, such as Katsu and BTM. Officer Ferreira doesn't think he is out of touch (in response to Greg Dillon) and he talks about his experience with youth and graffiti writers. He wants the Board "to be honest with what a lot of it is and what a lot of it isn't. Look past everything painting with a broad brush and there's a lot of good and bad." Unfortunately, his job deals with the bad parts. Officer Ferreira offers his assistance with the research.
- ix. Greg Dillon says that his conversations with San Franciscans outside the Graffiti Advisory Board is not the same as the ones within the Board. San Franciscans do not like graffiti [vandalism] in their neighborhood in general.
- x. Ramses Alvarez clarifies that the annual report has not been done in 2 years. The Board decides the content and recommendations and the Chair presents it to the Board of Supervisors. The report should be completed by July 1<sup>st</sup>.
- 9. Adjournment Motion to adjourn 4:30 pm

## Accessible Meeting Information:



#### Virtual Meetings

Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, meetings will be held virtually on WebEx until further notice.

To join the meeting and appear on video, you would need a computer with a webcam. Please install <u>Google Chrome web browser</u>, download the <u>WebEx Google Chrome</u> <u>Extension</u>, and locate the <u>meeting links</u> on SF Public Works' Graffiti Advisory Board page ahead of time.

You may also call in on your phone from anywhere in the world; <u>toll-free numbers</u> will be provided ahead of time and you do not need an attendee code or number to access the meeting. However, you would not be able to view the presentations and documents shared via video.



Minutes of the meeting are available in alternative formats. If you require the use of a reader during the meeting, American Sign Language interpreters, and/or a sound enhancement system, please call DPW's Accessibility Access Coordinator at (415) 557-4685 at least 72 hours prior to the hearing.

Individuals with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call our accessibility hotline at (415) 557-4685 to discuss meeting accessibility. In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate such people, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

#### KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, Boards, Councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review.

For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 or phone (415) 554-7724, Fax (415) 554-7854 or E-mail spotf@sfgov.org

## LOBBYIST REGISTRATION AND REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code § 2.100] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 252-3100; fax (415) 252-3112 or web site: www.sfethics.org.

## LANGUAGE INTERPRETORS

Request must be received at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing to ensure availability. ESPAÑOL: La solicitud de un intérprete debe recibirse 48 horas antes de la reunión. 中文: 如需即時傳譯,請於會議前最少四十八小時通知 07/07/13